# UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF LABOR MINE SAFETY AND HEALTH ADMINISTRATION Metal and Nonmetal Mine Safety and Health

## REPORT OF INVESTIGATION

Surface Non Metal Mine (Sand)

Fatal Fall of Material Accident March 14, 2017

at

Cottonwood #1204
Trinity Materials, Inc.
Ferris, Texas
Mine ID No. 41-04553

**Accident Investigators** 

Homer Allen Pricer Jr.
Mine Safety and Health Supervisor

Lance Miller
Mine Safety and Health Inspector

Ray Hurtado Mine Safety and Health Inspector

Originating Office
Mine Safety and Health Administration
South Central District
1100 Commerce Street RM 462
Dallas, TX 75242
Michael Davis, District Manager

# **Table of Contents**

OVERVIEW	Page 1
GENERAL INFORMATION	Page 2
DESCRIPTION OF ACCIDENT	Page 2
INVESTIGATION OF THE ACCIDENT	Page 4
DISCUSSION	Page 4
ROOT CAUSE ANALYSIS	Page 6
CONCLUSION	Page 6
Appendix A PERSONS PARTICIPATING IN THE INVESTIGATION	Page 7
Appendix B ACCIDENT INVESTIGATION DATA	Page 8



# **OVERVIEW**

On March 14, 2017, Julio C. Flores (age 52), a customer truck driver, was fatally injured when he exited the cab of his tractor trailer, walked to the rear of the trailer, and was engulfed by sand dumped from his trailer.

The accident occurred because the victim entered the area behind the raised trailer bed while unloading concrete sand material.

#### **GENERAL INFORMATION**

The Cottonwood #1204 Mine is a surface open pit, sand facility owned and operated by Trinity Materials, Inc. The mine is located in Kaufman County, Ferris, Texas and the principal operating official is Reid Essl, President. The facility employs 30 persons and operates two, twelve-hour shifts, six days a week.

Sand and gravel is removed from the pit by excavators and loaded into haul trucks. The material is taken to the dump hopper where it is then transported via an overland belt to the screening plant. The wet screening plant separates the material into masonry sand, concrete sand, pea gravel, and 1 inch rock. The finished material is loaded into over the road haul trucks and transported to other sites for use in construction.

The Mine Safety and Health Administration (MSHA) completed the regular inspection at Cottonwood #1204 mine on March 7, 2017.

#### **DESCRIPTION OF ACCIDENT**

Julio C. Flores, a customer truck driver/owner operator, arrived at the Cottonwood #1204 mine on March 14, 2017, at approximately 5:30 a.m., to get a load of concrete sand. Flores traveled to the load out area and a Cottonwood mine employee using a front end loader, dumped two loader buckets of concrete sand, weighing approximately 27 tons, into his end dump trailer. Once loaded, Flores traveled to the scale to receive his invoice. Scale House Operator/Office Assistant Pam Isaaks radioed to Flores and said he would need to get an empty weight of the truck and trailer because company policy states "an empty weight is required every 14 days," which was prompted by the computer system. Flores exited the scale and drove his tractor trailer to the designated area where drivers are instructed to dump. This was the last contact anyone at the mine site had with the victim until the body was discovered at 11:43 a.m. The truck had been spotted by various personnel in the raised position over the course of approximately six hours.

There were no eyewitnesses to the accident. The following is a list of events based on the investigation, observations and interviews.

Once at the dump area, it appears Flores set the park brakes on the end dump trailer and engaged the trailer's power take-off (PTO). Flores then set the revolution per minute (RPM) on the truck's engine to approximately 1600 rpms to allow the trailer to ascend faster. Flores exited the cab wearing his hard hat, carrying his safety vest and gloves and walked alongside of the truck to pull the air valve to release the air actuated "dogs" or latches for the dump gate. As the trailer was rising, Flores apparently walked to the rear of the dump trailer and was engulfed by the sand from the trailer.

At 10:56 a.m., Henry Casarres, Lead Man, was notified by a miner that the truck and trailer had been in the same spot with the engine running and dump bed in the air for several hours. Casarres went to the location of the truck. He could not locate the driver and called Robert Villa, Plant Manager, to explain the situation. Villa instructed Isaaks to contact CKJ trucking, the haul broker. CKJ Trucking Manager Clint De Lange called Flore's cell phone which could be heard ringing in the cab of the truck. Since mine employees had already searched the mine, Villa instructed Casarres to start digging in the dump pile behind the trailer. At approximately 11:20 a.m., Casarres went to the lunch room to get shovels and the mine employees began digging. Mine management called the MSHA Dallas field office and told them they had a man missing.

At 11:43 a.m. Flores was found at the bottom of the pile of dumped concrete sand and 911 was called. Mine employees began first aid on Flores until it was determined he had no pulse. Kaufman County EMS and Sheriffs along with Rosser Volunteer Fire Department arrived at the scene a short time later.

The autopsy results indicated no trauma to the head or body and the cause of death was listed as mechanical asphyxia and smothering.

#### INVESTIGATION OF ACCIDENT

Arturo Munoz, Safety Manager, notified MSHA of the accident at 11:54 a.m. CST., on March 14, 2017, by phone to the Department of Labor National Contact Center (DOLNCC). The DOLNCC notified Elwood Burriss, District Staff Assistant, and an investigation was started the same day. An order was issued under the provisions of Section 103(k) of the Mine Act to insure the safety of the miners.

MSHA's accident investigation team traveled to the mine, conducted a physical inspection of the accident scene, conducted interviews and reviewed documents and work procedures relevant to the accident. MSHA conducted the investigation with the assistance of the mine, its employees and contractor management.

#### DISCUSSION

# **Location of the Accident**

The accident occurred at the designated dump area immediately adjacent to the main haul road, located on the east side of the primary sand plant. The victim's truck was parked on relatively dry and level ground.

# **Weather**

The weather at the time of the accident was clear, calm winds and a temperature approximately 34 degrees Fahrenheit. Weather was not considered to be a factor in the accident.

# **Truck/Trailer Information**

The 2009 Kenworth tractor involved in the accident was an over the road truck. The end dump trailer was a 1998 Travis body semi-trailer. The truck and trailer were of the type commonly used on public highways. A warning sign attached to the trailer stated "stand clear of gate while unloading."

The PTO on this tractor trailer is a system comprised of a splined output shaft on the truck, designed so that a PTO shaft can be easily connected and disconnected, with a corresponding input shaft on the

application end to the trailer. The PTO allows implements to draw energy from the truck's engine.

# Service Technician (Premier Truck Group) Inspection

On March 17, 2017, at approximately 07:30 a.m., Rick Allen, Service Technician, met with the investigation team to evaluate and examine the tractor truck and trailer. The technician and investigation team performed and identified the following:

- Conducted a pre-operational inspection to determine if it was safe to examine and operate the truck in its current state. It was necessary to repair two air lines to safely lower and secure the trailer.
- Performed a diagnostics test on the truck to determine if there were any mechanical or electrical issues. No defects were found.
- Inspected the truck's PTO system and determined the PTO was burned up but likely suffered this damage due to the length of time the truck was idling at high rpm.
- Conducted a brake check measurement of the linkage which did not indicate any safety issues.
- Examined the truck tires and determined they were properly inflated and in good condition.
- Tested the trailer gate latching mechanism ('dogs'). They were found to latch and hold as designed.

# Training and Experience

Flores had 13 years of experience driving an over the road semitruck. For the last 7 years, Flores frequented this mine site to pick up and transport material as needed. Company Policy/Procedures Training provided to customer truck drivers includes: observe and obey all traffic control signs, speed limits, warnings and exits; when necessary, to get out of your vehicle, park in a designated parking area; never exit the vehicle when being loaded; and do not stand behind equipment while unloading. All aggregate haulers are required to report to the office/scale house or point of contact prior to starting work.

#### **ROOT CAUSE ANALYSIS**

A root cause analysis was conducted and the following root cause was identified:

Root Cause: The customer truck driver failed to stand clear of the trailer gate while unloading material.

Corrective Action: Evaluate the effectiveness of Site-Specific Hazard Awareness Training provided to customer truck drivers to ensure that all hazards associated with each task are identified and understood. Customer truck drivers should follow warning signs and equipment labels and follow company's policies and procedures while on mining properties.

### CONCLUSION

A customer truck driver was engulfed in sand when he walked behind his tractor trailer while dumping a load of concrete sand. The accident occurred because the customer truck driver did not maintain a safe distance from the rear of trailer where the sand material was being unloaded.

Approved:	Date:	
Michael A. Davis		
District Manager		

# Appendix A Persons Participating in the Investigation

# Trinity Materials, INC.

Henry Casarres Lead-man
Robert Villa Plant Manager
Arturo Munoz Safety Director

Pam Isaaks Scale Operator/Office Assistant

Michael Stripe Vice President Safety

Justin Allen Associate General Counsel Scott Ewing Associate General Counsel

**CKJ Trucking LP** 

Clint DeLange Independent Contractor Manager

Premier Truck Group

Rick Allen Service Technician

Mine Safety and Health Administration

Homer Allen Pricer Jr. Supervisory Mine Safety and Health

Inspector

Lance Miller Mine Safety and Health Inspector

Ray Hurtado Mine Safety and Health Inspector

.

# Appendix B

Accident Investigation Data Event Number: 6 7 3	5 3	7 2							rtmer				
Victim Information: 1	-	- 2		_			Min	Safety	and He	alth Adn	ninistra	tion	W//
Name of Injured/III Employee:	2. Sax	3. Victim)	. Ace	4. Degree	of later	_							
Julio C. Flores	м	52		O1 Fa	- 050								
5. Date(MM/DD/YY) and Time(24 Hr.) of				1 07 18	1	te and Tim	e Started						
a. Date: 03/14/2017 b.Time:	6:00							7 b. Time: 5	-70				
7. Regular Job Title:			8. Work	Activity when	Injured		0214201	- 0. Janes - 0		this work ac	thathe most	of ones lac	Lohe
176 Over the road independent	truck drive	v		loading OTR		a/ier			J. 7746			urregular	1007
10. Experience Years Weeks	Days		h X			0.811	Succession	2012		Yes	X No	3	
a. This	Dego	<ol> <li>Begular</li> </ol>	Years	Weeks	Days	c This	Years	Weeks	Days	d. Total	Years	Weeks	Day
Work Activity: 13 10	2	Job Title:	13	10	2	Mine	13	10	2	Mining:	13	10	2
<ol> <li>What Directly Inflicted Injury or litness</li> </ol>						12. Natur	e of injury o	r Piness:					
093 27.5 tons of sand buried v 13. Training Deficiencies.	vesim					110	asphynia/b	rushing into	es				
	who Employ	red Experien	rood Miner	1/2			Annual I		-				
4. Company of Employment, (If different						- 2	Annual		Task	1.74			
Capricom Trucking (Independe 5. On-site Emergency Medical Treatmer	nt Trucker,						Inc	lependent C	ontractor I	D: (if applica	ible)		
Not Applicable: First-Ai			on.	11122		35330		60004		1350			
Part 50 Document Control Number: ()			PR:	EMT.			cal Professi	onal:	None:	X			
Sctim Information:	Juliu / 000-	9		-	17. Unio	n Affiliation	of Victim:	9999	None	(Na Union	Afficiation)		
Name of Injured/III Employee:	0.000	Ta territ					1			TO STATE OF THE ST			
ve represent Employee	2. Sex	3. Vicam's	nge :	4. Degree i	or Injury:			1					
Date(MM/DD/YY) and Time(24 Hr.) O	f Death:			1	6 Da	le and Tim	e Started:						
Regular Job Title:			B. Work A	ctivity when I	njured:				9. Was	this work ac	tivity nort	of movies	ok?
									- reads	Yes Yes	No No	or regutal	u0 r
D. Experience: Years Weeks	Days	b. Regular	Years	Weeks	Days	c. This	Years	Week	Days	d. Total		Weeks	Days
Aork Activity:		Job Title:				Mine:				Mining.			
<ol> <li>What Directly Inflicted Injury or liness:</li> </ol>	?					2. Nature	of Injury or	liness:					
Table 8 61													
Training Deficiencies:     Meurbland	to Emistered			1.0									
		ed Experienc				- 4	Annual:	1	Task				
<ol> <li>Company of Employment: (If different)</li> </ol>	from produ	iction operate	or).			Indeno	ideal Costs	and a series of					
On-aite Emergency Medical Treatment						пиворы	dent Contr	actor ID: (if a	appricable)				
Not Applicable First-Aid		CPR	1	EMT:	1 10	Marke	1 Floring	ar II i	122314	100			
3. Part 50 Document Control Number: (fo				-			l Professio	nat	None:				
Victim Information:				- 1/	. Union	Affiliation	of Victim:						
Name of Injured/III Employee:	2 Sex	3. Victim's /	lan	4 Beens of									
	7.50	a vicality	Qu.	4. Degree of	anjury:								
Date(MM/DD/YY) and Time(24 Hr.) Of	Death:				6. Dat	e and Tim	Started:						
	Death:		II West a	etala mbes l		e and Tim	e Started:		2000				
	Death:		8. Work A	ctivity when I		e and Tim	e Started:		9. Was t	his work acti	ivity part o	f regular jo	b?
Regular Job Title:	Death:		B. Work A	icāvity when I		e and Tim	e Started:		9. Was t	his work act	ivity part o	f regular jo	b?
Regular Job Title:  Experience: Years Weeks This	Death:	b. Regular	8. Work A			c:This	e Started:	Week	9. Was t	Yes d. Total	No	f regular jo	b? Days
Regular Job Titler  Experience: Years Weeks This on Activity:	Days	30.07.00	20000000		njured. Days	c This	Years	1000		Yes	No		
Regular Job Title:  Experience: Years Weeks on Activity:  What Directly inflicted injury or linesa?  Training Deficiencies:	Days	b. Regular Job Title:	Years	Weeks	njured. Days	c This		1000		Yes d. Total	No		
Regular Job Title:  Experience: Yeara Weeks This ark Activity: What Directly inflicted injury or linesa?  Training Deficiencies: Hazard: NewNee	Days vty-Employ	b. Regular Job Title:	Years  ed Miner	Weeks	njured. Days	c: This Mine: 12. Nature	Years	1000		Yes d. Total	No		
Regular Job Title:  Experience: Years Weeks This  risk Activity:  What Directly inflicted injury or liness?  Training Deficiencies:  Hazard: NewNee	Days vty-Employ	b. Regular Job Title:	Years  ed Miner	Weeks	njured. Days	c This Mine: 12. Nature	Years of Injury or Annual	liness	Days Task:	Yes d. Total	No		
Regular Job Titler  Experience: Yeara Weeks This ors Activity: What Directly inflicted Injury or linesa?  Training Deficiencies: Hazard:   New New Company of Employment: (If different fr	Days vty-Employ	b. Regular Job Title:	Years  ed Miner	Weeks	njured. Days	c This Mine: 12. Nature	Years of Injury or Annual	1000	Days Task:	Yes d. Total	No		
Regular Job Title:  Expenience: Yeara Weeks This one Activity: What Directly inflicted injury or linesa?  Training Deficiencies: Hazard:   New/New Company of Employment: (If different fr	Days vly-Employ om produc	b. Regular Job Title: 4d Experiences Ston operator	Years  ced Minor  )	Weeks	njured. Days	c This Mine: 12 Nature	Years of Injury or Annuat	iliness	Days Task:	Yes d. Total	No		
This loss Activity: What Directly Inflicted Injury or linesa? Training Deficiencies:	Days  vly-Employ om produc	b. Regular Job Title:	Years  ced Minor  )	Weeks	Days	c This Mine 12 Nature independ	Years of Injury or Annual	iliness	Days Task:	Yes d. Total	No		
Regular Job Title:  Experience: Years Weeks This tork Activity:  What Directly inflicted Injury or lineas?  Training Deficiencies:  Hazard: Nowline  Company of Employment: (if different fr  On-site Emergency Medical Treatment;  Not Applicable: First-A	Days  vly-Employ om produc	b. Regular Job Title: 4d Experiences Ston operator	Years  ced Minor  )	Weeks	Days	c This Mine 12 Nature independ	Years of Injury or Annuat	iliness	Days Task:	Yes d. Total	No		